



OFFICE OF ADMINISTRATIVE TRIALS AND HEARINGS
Hearings Division
Decision

LANCE CHEBIN - NACMIAS LAW FIRM
592 PACIFIC STREET
NEW YORK, NY 11217

Summons# : 000854693Z et al. (1 summonses)

DEPT OF ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION,

-against-

ON PENSKE TRUCK LEASING CORPORATI

Hearing Date : 7/9/2025

Hearing Location : Remote

Type of Hearing : By Telephone

Total Penalty Amount : 350.00

Community Service(Hr): Not Applicable

SUMMONS #	SUMMARY DISPOSITION	DATE OF OCCURRENCE	PLACE OF OCCURRENCE
000854693Z	Sustained	03/06/2024	245 WEST 31 STREET, Manhattan

LINE ITEM	OATH CODE	CODE SECTION / RULE	RESULT	PENALTY
1	BA51	24 -163	Sustained	350.00

Total Penalty for Summons: 350.00

Findings of Facts & Conclusions of Law

Petitioner New York City Department of Environmental Protection (DEP) was represented by DEP court representative MICHAEL GROSSO, via email.

Respondent PENSKE TRUCK LEASING CORPORATION was represented by authorized representative LANCE CHEBIN of the Nacmias Law Firm.

Respondent was charged with a violation of § 24-163 of the Administrative Code of the City of New York (Code) for idling a motor vehicle engine for longer than three minutes.

In the summons, the Issuing Officer (IO) affirmed observing, based on information submitted by a citizen complainant (CC), that on March 6, 2024, at 245 West 31st Street in Manhattan, respondent caused or permitted the idling of a motor vehicle while parked, standing or stopped. The IO noted that as per DEP records, citizen observed TRUCK with IN License Plate #3337508 idling for longer than three minutes from 7:04:47AM to 7:08:44AM.

I find the Issuing Officer's sworn-to summons narrative to be credible and persuasive.

Respondent's attorney stated that he had reviewed the evidence packet and the video evidence previously provided to him and denied the violation without further rebuttal.

Code § 24-163(a) prohibits the idling of a motor vehicle engine in excess of three minutes while parked, standing, or stopped. Per § 6-12(b) of Title 48 of the Rules of the City of New York (RCNY), a summons affirmed under penalty of perjury will be admitted as prima facie evidence of the facts stated therein. Petitioner is therefore not required to submit a video at the hearing to establish its case. See DEP v. TM & T Service Station Inc., Appeal No. 1901827 (March 19, 2020), though citizen-complainants must supply one to DEP along with their complaint. See DEP v. U-Haul Co. of Arizona Inc., Appeal No. 2001342 (January 14, 2021). Even where a video is presented, the charge does not fail if the video does not clearly show the vehicle vibrating, producing visible emissions, or making audible engine noise. See DEP v. Hub Truck Rental Corp., Appeal No. 2001344 (February 11, 2021). In such cases, once Petitioner has established its prima facie case, the critical inquiry is whether the respondent has sustained its burden to refute Petitioner's evidence or otherwise establish a defense. See 48 RCNY § 6-12(a).

Code § 24-163(a) provides that no one shall permit the idling of a motor vehicle engine for longer than three minutes unless the engine is used to operate a loading, unloading, or processing device.

The credible evidence, here the sworn-to summons narrative of the Issuing Officer, is sufficient to establish, and I find, that respondent was in violation on the date of the offense. The violation is SUSTAINED, and I impose the penalty of \$350.



07/09/2025

07/09/2025

Mark Goichman, Hearing Officer

Date

**IF YOU ARE FOUND IN VIOLATION, AND ARE NOT ELIGIBLE OR DO NOT CHOOSE
COMMUNITY SERVICE, YOU MUST PAY THE PENALTY WITHIN 30 DAYS OF THE DECISION
DATE OR 35 DAYS IF MAILED.**

- To pay by mail, send a check or money order to the Dept. of Finance Commissioner, P.O. Box 2307, Peck Slip Station, New York, NY 10272. The check or money order should be made out to "Finance Commissioner, City of New York." Write the summons number on the check or money order.
- To pay in person, bring a check, money order or credit card and this decision to any OATH Hearings Division location between 8:30 a.m. to 4:30 p.m.
- To pay online using a credit or debit card, go to www.nyc.gov/citypay/oath

If you do not pay the penalty, the City may: (1) file papers with the Civil Court ("docket a judgment"), (2) charge you a late fee, and (3) continue attempts to collect the debt.

**CAN I DO
COMMUNITY
SERVICE?**

If your summons is for the type of offense that gives you a Community Service option you can choose to complete Community Service instead of paying a penalty. Your decision will give you that option. You have to complete your Community Service by the deadline in the decision or else you will end up owing the penalty. You can even do your Community Service on the day you receive your decision.

**COMPLETION OF
COMMUNITY
SERVICE**

The Help Center will arrange for you to complete your Community Service. The Help Center is run by the Ombudsperson/*Pro Se* Clerk at OATH and is located at each Hearing Division in all five boroughs. To schedule your Community Service, call, email or visit a Help Center location.

How to Contact the Help Center to Schedule Community Service:

Manhattan: (212) 436-0845 CSmanhattan@oath.nyc.gov
Brooklyn: (718) 923-6216 CSbrooklyn@oath.nyc.gov
Queens: (718) 393-6044 CSqueens@oath.nyc.gov
Bronx: (718) 503-5565 CSbronx@oath.nyc.gov
Staten Island: (718) 876-2314 CSstatenisland@oath.nyc.gov

If you complete your Community Service by the deadline in the decision, you will receive a Certificate of Completion and will not have to pay a penalty. If you need an extension to complete your Community Service, please contact the Help Center.

If you do not complete your Community Service by the deadline, you will have to pay the penalty.

**NON-DISCLOSURE
FOR SUMMONSES
ELIGIBLE FOR
COMMUNITY
SERVICE**

If you either completed the Community Service or paid the penalty, OATH will remove your identifying information from public records related to your case.

If you do not complete the Community Service or pay the penalty, your identifying information may remain on public records related to your case.

**IF YOU DISAGREE
WITH THE DECISION,
YOU MAY APPEAL IT**

To submit your appeal, you **MUST** use OATH's online or mail-in appeal forms available on OATH's website at www.nyc.gov/oath/appeal. Instructions for filing an appeal may be found on the form and OATH's website.

Your appeal **MUST** be received by the OATH Hearings Division **within 30 days** of the decision date, or 35 days if the decision was mailed to you.

To appeal you **may need** to pay the full penalty stated in this decision.

- If you cannot pay because of financial hardship, you may ask to not pre-pay by submitting with your appeal a Financial Hardship Application, available on OATH's website.
- If you are eligible and choose to perform Community Service instead of paying the penalty, you do not have to pay the penalty or complete the Community Service to appeal.

**APPEAL BY
ENFORCEMENT
AGENCY**

If you wish to answer an appeal filed by an enforcement agency, you **MUST** use OATH's Response To Appeal form. Instructions for filing an answer may be found on the form and OATH's website.

Your answer must be received **within 30 days** of the date of the enforcement agency's appeal, or 35 days if it was mailed to you.

If the enforcement agency wins the appeal, you may have to pay a penalty or, if eligible, complete Community Service even if your case was originally dismissed after the hearing.

For more information,
visit OATH's website www.nyc.gov/oath
or call 1-844-OATH-NYC

112018